POETRY AND THE EXTREMITIES
OF LANGUAGE:
FROM CONCRETISM TO PAUL CELAN

JAMES K. LYON
University of California, San Diego

With the death in 1970 of Paul Celan, perhaps the strongest lyric voice in the German language after 1945, it could be asserted that the era of writers who shaped post-World War II German poetry was ending. Author of the well-known "Fugue of Death" whose verse is said to have summed up a century of European lyric poetry,[1] Celan was one of the few internationally recognized recent German-language poets, and probably the only one who had an impact on American verse. To a few important American poets in the sixties on whom his verse left a mark, among them John Berryman, Robert Bly, James Wright, and Donald Hall, the name Celan became a secret password.

A seemingly unrelated development, the apparent decline in the early seventies of "concrete poetry," also signaled the waning of another contemporaneous mode of lyric expression. "Concrete poetry" is used here as a collective term to designate those experimental modes of poetic creation which, though often using visual and phonic elements, were primarily experiments with words and texts designed to achieve lyric effects through visual, spatial, and semantic arrangements. The appearance of major anthologies of concrete poetry, an early warning signal that a movement has achieved both recognition and fulfillment, began in 1967 and seems to have reached a crest around 1969 when Eugen Gomringer's *worte sind schatten (words are shadows)* appeared.[2] After 1970 critics began publishing pronouncements on the near-demise of concrete poetry as an

outmoded form of expression,[3] and some of its leading practitioners turned to other forms of creativity.

As coordinates on the map of German lyric poetry in the decades immediately following WW II, these disparate events, though seemingly unrelated, are in fact closely-connected points of orientation, though Celan doubtless would have disputed it. To mention Celan in the same breath with Gomringer, Franz Mon, Reinhard Döhl, Ernst Jandl, Hansjörg Mayer, Friedrich Achleitner, Gerhard Rühm, and perhaps Helmut Heissenbüttel would have angered him, who in many ways felt himself to be outside the mainstream of German language lyric poetry as it developed after 1945. It was these and others he meant when he spoke contemptuously of "experimenting around on every lyric street corner with so-called 'word material'."[4] Critics, too, usually categorize them separately, with Celan listed among so-called "hermetic" poets and the concretists among the "experimental poets."[5]

Despite these classifications, and in spite of an antagonism Celan felt toward nearly all contemporary German language poets (which bordered on open hostility),[6] he was very much part of his time. Critics who have tended to view his verse in the German tradition of Hölderlin or Trakl and the European Symbolist tradition seldom look at him against the backdrop of German or European poetry of the fifties and sixties. One exception, Peter Horst Neumann, argues that his poetry resists isolated investigation outside the context of its time. According to Neumann, the language and form of Celan's verse exemplify both the possibilities and the dilemma of all contemporary poetic language.[7]

Subscribing to Neumann's view, this essay shall attempt to demonstrate that in spite of differences, Celan's verse is in fact paradigmatic for much of what the concretists claimed they were trying to do in the fifties and sixties. It does not mean to ignore or minimize obvious differences, but tries only to illuminate many points of convergence and to examine similarities and affinities that arise from their relationship to the language of an age which they perceived to be basically unpoetic. No attempt will be made to pass judgment on the validity of the theories which concrete poetry posits about the nature of language, nor to pin labels such as "nonsense verse" or "superficial word juggling" on this lyric form. The chief concern is to examine this lyric phenomenon next to Celan's verse as curiously

complementary witnesses for the possibilities of poetic speech during the decades following WW II.

Among other things, it also attempts to illustrate common features in their attitudes toward their poetic intentions, their mode of creativity, their word usage, and the language of their day. I shall show that the critical terminology used by interpreters and apologists to describe both Celan and the concrete poets often sounds almost interchangeable. Finally I hope to demonstrate how, in spite of differences, Celan and the concretists were children of the same age whose writings were primarily self-conscious reflections on the nature of language itself.

It has become a commonplace of Celan criticism to speak of verse existing at "the extremity of speech" or "the edge of silence."[8] Celan himself acknowledged modern poetry's inclination toward total silence, but insisted that the poem does maintain itself "at its own extremity."[9] The concrete poets' preoccupation with silence as a basic element of speech is also well known and can be typified by Eugen Gomringer's poem "silence" ("Schweigen"), one of the first associated with this movement in the early fifties:

schweigen schweigen schweigen
schweigen schweigen schweigen
schweigen   schweigen
schweigen schweigen schweigen
schweigen schweigen schweigen

Written by the acknowledged father of German language concrete poetry,[10] it consists of five lines that repeat only the word "silence." But the single white space left by one missing word in the center of the third line is as meaningful as the words that form the entire poem. Visually Gomringer is illustrating his claim that "the poet is someone who breaks silence in order to evoke a new silence."[11] Both Celan and Gomringer were acutely aware of working at these outer limits of language where poetry must struggle to maintain itself against muteness.

This attitude has a corollary in their linguistic development. Geographically Celan came from an extremity of the German language, i.e. Rumania, while Gomringer was born beyond the fringes of spoken German in Bolivia. Though raised in Switzerland, Gomringer grew up bilingual and wrote his first concrete poems in Spanish before he wrote German.[12] His location in Switzerland and the immediate resonance his poetry found among members of the so-called "Vienna Group" in the mid-fifties before concrete poetry penetrated into Germany might symbolize its peripheral geographical and linguistic existence. With the possible exception of Heissenbüttel's works, one might say that German concrete poetry began at the geographical peripheries of the language and only then moved into Germany itself.

Celan grew up multilingual in what has been called the region of the "fifth German literature,"[13] viz. Rumania. Speaking German, French, and Rumanian in his youth he wrote considerable early poetry in Rumanian. Settling in Paris after the war, he consciously chose to continue his poetic career using the language of the murderers of parents who had taught him German, a significant choice as it turned out for German letters. But Celan's other decision never to live in a German-speaking country meant that he was more or less cut off from daily contact with the spoken language. This may account in part for a poetry whose vocabulary and syntax strikes us as being quite different from most German spoken or written in this century. His constant efforts, reported by friends, to keep in touch with the living language by reading or by visiting German-speaking countries might also be seen as a symptom of the intense crisis of speech that manifests itself so often in his poems.[14] Whatever the case, both Celan and Gomringer began exploring the potential of that language at its outer limits, both geographically and linguistically.

Their poetry also arose from a similar attitude toward language that has at least one common root—French Symbolism, especially the poetry of Mallarmé. It is no coincidence that Gomringer's first volume of poems bore the title *Konstellationen,* for he acknowledges that his readings of Mallarmé led him to write the kind of lyrics he did.[15] Gomringer knew Mallarmé's concept of the poem as a constellation from "Un coup de Dés," where words and letters are organized to make the spatial arrangement which resembles a stellar constellation at least as significant as the syntactical arrangement:

EXCEPTÉ
           à l'altitude
                   PEUT-ÊTRE
                           aussi loin qu'un endroit

fusionne avec au-delà

<div style="text-align: center">

hors l'intérêt
quant à lui signalé
en général
selon telle obliquité par telle déclivité
de feux

vers
ce doit être
le Septentrion aussi Nord

UNE CONSTELLATION

froide d'oubli et de désuétude
pas tant
qu'elle n'énumère
sur quelque surface vacante et supérieure
le heurt successif
sidéralement
d'un compte total en formation

veillant
doutant
roulant
brillant et méditant

avant de s'arrêter
à quelque point dernier qui le sacre

Toute Pensée émet un Coup de Dés

</div>

This was Gomringer's direct model for his earliest concrete poems. Celan, too, learned from Mallarmé—his injuction in 1960 "to think Mallarmé through to his logical conclusion"[16] was made by a poet whose despair at the limitations of language represents the same fundamental questioning of the art of poetry that Mallarmé began. In

several passages Celan's verse also seems to equate words with stars, and in one poem he used *Siebenstern,* the German equivalent of the "Septentrion,"[17] which had appeared in Mallarmé's "Un coup de Dés" as a representation of the ultimate word constellation.

The joint debt to Mallarmé goes far beyond common word use or terminology. For both Celan and the concretists, the primary concern of language is no longer to create a world of symbol or metaphor. Speaking of concrete poetry, its foremost theoretician, Max Bense, states: "The word is not used primarily as a bearer of meaning, but beyond that as elemental creative matter."[18] Beda Allemann, one of Celan's most sensitive interpreters, makes a similar claim when he states that for Celan "language is viewed as something real in itself and does not confront extra-linguistic realities as a system of carriers of meaning."[19] Together with Mallarmé, Celan and the concretists became aware that most words of common and poetic speech had fallen victim to the "verbicide" of modern usage. Hence it is not strange that both share a strong anti-metaphorical attitude. Celan repeatedly insisted that there were no metaphors.[20] Poetic language for him existed without the conventional distinction between words and the objects or ideas they might represent. Words possessed their own reality, and nearly all of his poems are explorations of realities of words rather than the metaphoric reality of more conventional poetry.

Bense's description of the theory underlying concrete texts could be applied almost verbatim to Celan's verse. He states: "The medium of signs is not the external world which a text describes, but rather the sovereign world in which it arises, that is the materiality of language itself. Only in this world do those events take place which transform syllables, words, sentences, and periods into the open, unfinished, transmutable, agile, and delicate condition of signs."[21] Heissenbüttel reacts to Gomringer's concrete poems by praising in them a use of language that strips words of their capacity to form metaphors.[22] Words are to be reduced to their material state before they can be made meaningful. An example of this view of words primarily as "material" is Konrad Balder Schauffelen's "dispose of poets. from the German frequency list" ("beseitigt dichters. aus der deutschen rangliste"), a text in which he publishes the 999 most frequently occurring words in the German language in their order of frequency, but separated by extensive punctuation and with occasional repetitions. The graphic arrangement resembling verse gives some idea of what words can still do when used in this anti-metaphorical sense:

die
der
und . . . ? in . . . zu den . . . ?
das nicht! von . . .
sie ist des . . .
sich mit dem, daß er es ein . . .?
ich?
auf so eine?
auch, als an . . .
nach, wie im für . . .
man aber . . . aus
durch!
wenn nur . . . war noch . . .
werden bei . . . hat!
wir: "was wird sein?"
einen!
welche sind, oder um haben
einer mir . . . über ihm . . . diese einem
ihr uns da zum, zur . . .
kann doch vor dieser mich . . .
ihn!
— du! . . .
hatte seine mehr am . . .
denn nun, unter sehr selbst . . .
(schon hier, bis . . .)
habe ihre dann ihnen . . .
seiner alle wieder
"meine Zeit!"
gegen . . .
vom ganz einzelnen
wo muss?
ohne!
eines können sei: "ja!"
wurde jetzt immer seinen . . .
wohl dieses . . . ihres!
würde diesen.
sondern weil . . .
welcher nichts?
diesem alles!
waren will Herr viel?
mein!
also soll!
. . . worden lassen . . .
dies machen
ihren!
weiterleben!
Recht: etwas . . . keine seinem
ob dir allen großen?
jahreweise müssen!
welches wäre erst einmal . . .
Mann!
. . . hätte zwei . . .
dich allein!
("Herren")
während Paragraph: "liebe andere . . . kein . . ."
damit gar Hand.
Herrn!
euch sollte (konnte) . . . !

The name "concrete" poetry derives from the view of language as material in its irreducible state. In conversations with friends, Celan, too, is said to have emphasized both the hardness and "concreteness" of language.[23] Almost every critic mentions his "stone-like language"[24] in connection with the frequent words for stone and hardness in his verse. If one accepts a prevalent view among Celan's interpreters that the majority of his poems, especially the later ones, are reflections on poetry itself, on the words that constitute them and on the inherent reality of these words, the proximity of Celan's view of language to that of the concretists becomes clear. For him adequate poetic counters for language locked in the hardness of silence and inexpressibility are words conventionally used to designate rock or stone. They might be considered "concrete" both for their material quality as primeval matter as well as for their implication of hardness. Thus the repeated descriptions of rocks splitting open or of volcanic upheavals in Celan's verse clearly refer to the act of poetic speech itself. He went beyond the concretists in ways to be discussed later, but in regard to "concreteness" of the material poets work with, his poems express what the concretists state theoretically.

Max Bense, for example, speaks of the "mineral-like style" of many concretist texts and even calls his own texts *Dünnschliffe*—a geological term designating cross-sections cut from rock.[25] Franz Mon adds that language forms "must be freed from the familiarity which is inherent in every verbal utterance as a corollary to the language of the speaker and forced into hardness, into hypostasis, i.e. its essential substance."[26] "Hardness" and "hypostasis" are the key words here, for language is to be reduced to its material state of primary matter. Reference to external meaning is only secondary.

When the concrete poet Hansjörg Mayer wrote that "texts are reality,"[27] he formulated in an extreme way a theme that pervades both Celan's statements on his poems and concrete poets' attitude toward their creations. For the concretists, attempting to draw attention away from abstract meanings and to the essence of the word itself as a linguistic reality constitutes a means of creating and exploring that reality. Franz Mon points out, for example, that "for the first time a language develops which has cast off all indefiniteness and offers a pure, unequivocal presentation of a reality which only it has established."[28] Gomringer sees this kind of poetry as having a function essential to the existence of the writer or speaker: "In my opinion it must be tied ultimately to the challenge of each (writer's)

individual existence: that individual's 'life' with language, his 'life with words'."[29] Thus a 1970 anthology published to honor Max Bense on his 60th birthday bore the title *Models of Possible Worlds* which, as the editor assures us, ". . . are models of possible aesthetic worlds. . . . Bense emphasizes the possibility of forming this second reality through interference with or manipulation of physical conditions. In Bense's work, this degrading of the existing world and its meanings leads to 'textual events' which happen in a world whose limits are determined by the distribution of words and sentences used."[30]

Celan's "life with words" can also be seen as an anguished attempt to orient himself in the world and to discover reality through words. In his 1958 Bremen speech he acknowledged that during the years since he began writing poetry in German, he did it "in order to speak, to orient myself, to determine where I was and where I was being taken, to sketch out reality for myself."[31] One is reminded of Heissenbüttel's similar formulation that concrete poetry is "not only a new 'literary' mode of speaking, but also a new way by means of language to orient oneself in this world."[32]

Celan was concerned with the ontological location of poetic creation. Like many artists of this century, creating with words was for him a means of orientation in this search. His Darmstadt speech in 1960, possibly his most important theoretical remarks on his attitude toward poetry in the present age, described his own writings as an exploration in the realm of words, as "ways in which language became articulate, . . . sketches of existence perhaps, an extension of one's self ahead to oneself, in search of one's self."[33] Several times in it he claims "I'm searching." He then acknowledges that "I do find something . . . like language . . . immaterial, but earth-bound, terrestrial, something circular, turning over two poles back onto itself and thus—: I find . . . a meridian." "Meridian," the title of his speech, and similar words of geographical orientation also recur in later poems. These poems contain a striking number of geographical place names; from Prague, Zurich, Hamburg, and Berlin to Oranienstrasse 1, Mapesbury Road, and Highgate. From the use of many such names as titles of poems, one observes how Celan's quest for orientation manifests itself in poems presumably about places, but in fact poems that use place names as another means of locating oneself in relation to one's language.

The concretists view their attempt to strip words of conventional metaphoric implications as an impulse which can, they hope, restore

words to the condition of primordial language. Bense states that "every attempt to transport the beauties of language from their meanings back into their material forms allows archaic structures to emerge."[34] Franz Mon notes that through this process "language again becomes hard, fresh, enjoyable in its elemental condition. The state of the primeval word seems to flash like sheet lightning. Words were housings for objects; now they are a new kind of objects themselves."[35] Celan interpreters also draw attention to what one has called his "struggle for a primordial language,"[36] or, as another one puts it, an attempt "to find his way back to the lingua Adamica."[37] Because this primeval impulse has fundamental implications for his total language usage, it deserves close consideration.

Celan shares with the concretists the view that most contemporary language is destructive of poetic diction. His own, he stated, had survived "the thousand darknesses of death-bringing speech,"[38] by which he meant recent and contemporary German. His poetry might be said to do roughly what Franz Mon stated that concrete poetry undertook. It acted "as an alternative to the contemporary surfeit of words, as an unobtrusive but radical critique of the mass of talk by speakers who are unaware that they are working with thousands of ready-made expressions."[39] For Celan, this involved consciously using a vocabulary that defies comparison with almost any German language poet in this century. In his general avoidance of modernisms and his occasional cultivation of archaisms, he stands so far removed from the slogans, catch-words, and clichés of the daily spoken language that from a list of his vocabulary reduced to its component parts one could hardly recognize this poetry as belonging to the middle decades of the 20th century. His unique word material has not been examined thoroughly, but a few examples will illuminate the splendid isolation in which it existed among contemporaries.

In Celan's verse, one finds oneself reading against the current because of two phenomena. First, while his basic vocabulary consists of many ordinary words like *heart, hair, tree, mouth,* or *star,* his verse increasingly forms unfamiliar compounds that effectively defamiliarize these familiar terms. As compounds of the word *heart,* for example, one encounters "heart track"; "heartnever"; "heart-becomingness"; "heart finger"; "heart hammer silver"; "heart sense"; "heart coin"; "heart shadow rope" and many others. This applies to dozens of similar words which alone are familiar, but as compounds are unrecognizable. The second phenomenon concerns totally unfamiliar or faintly familiar words that are nevertheless

legitimate. They can be classified under four subheadings. First, there are conscious archaisms, such as *Teufe* for *Tiefe* ("depth") (FS 12), a usage that has persisted today only in mining and geological terminology; or *Gehugnis* (LZ 101), Celan's New High German rendering of Middle High German *gehugnisse* meaning "memory" or "recall." A second, larger category involves uncommon or obscure words that still exist in the German language, but which either never acquired wide usage or have been largely forgotten. *"Sprachgitter,"* ("speech grill"), for example, is a legitimate word for the small window in cloisters through which a nun spoke with the outside world. He found it in Jean Paul's *Titan*,[40] but he was doubtless also aware of its literal usage, though few modern readers would be. Words such as *kätnert* (from *Kätner;* "cottager"); or *Trumm* ("thrum") illustrate further his predisposition toward infrequently used words. Others such as *Zwille* ("catapult") or *Waldwasen* ("forest sod") might be considered as a third category of words that are obscure because they are regionalisms, though they are in fact legitimate entries in any standard dictionary. Finally, and by far the largest category of unrecognizable but distinctly German words he uses are technical terms drawn from a variety of specialized fields.

His enormous knowledge, both of technical words and of the disciplines from which he drew them, amazed those who knew this true *poeta doctus*. Hans-Georg Gadamer reports that on a visit by Celan to Heidegger's home in the Black Forest, Heidegger was astonished that Celan knew plant and animal names there better than he himself.[41] Gerhart Baumann, who also knew the poet personally, adds that because of Celan's vital interest in the names of objects, activities, structures, and the world of sight and sound, he kept notebooks with minute observations and immersed himself in dictionaries to study etymologies and meanings of these words he learned.[42] Technical terms from the earth sciences, for example, probably constitute the largest single number of specialized words in Celan's poetry.[43] *Meermühle, Steindattel, Harnischstriemen, Tuff, Drusen,* and *Schrunde* are only a few of literally dozens of words that Celan found from reading technical dictionaries or works in this field. Many of them can be traced to specific books in his personal library. A friend recalls Celan's discovering the term *Meermühle* ("sea mill") along with an illustration of this geological phenomenon in a work entitled *The History of the Origins of the Earth*[44] *(Die Entwicklungsgeschichte der Erde),* and he owned and read other books on physical geography, astronomical geography, physical oceanography, and

glaciation, to mention only a few areas of interest.[45] Baumann notes that Celan was also well versed on the topic of crystalline structures,[46] which accounts in part for the repeated use in his poems of words dealing with crystal formations.

Space does not permit an enumeration of all the areas where Celan searched for obscure or specialized words not worn out by overuse, but they would include botany (*Steinbrech; Paulownia*); biology (*Mantis*); language of the hunt (*verhoffen; Bogengebete*); terminology of war (*Panzerfaust*); medicine (*Aorta; Furche und Windungen; Hämoglobin*); medieval alchemy (*solve; coagula*); music (*Engführung*); mining (*Geleucht; taubes Gestein*); astronomy (*Alpha Centauri; Berenike*); and many others. According to Baumann, he saw in these half-forgotten, unusual-sounding designations, many of which had been kept alive for decades or centuries only within special circles, a pregnancy, a primeval originality, and a vividness lacking in much modern speech.[47] Significantly, nouns, i.e. names of objects, comprise the majority of these technical terms. The impluse of name-giving basic to poetry in every age is especially evident in Celan's work. By discovering, or re-discovering what might be called "original names," he, too, was seeking to become like the "Baal Shem," the "Master of the Good Name" in that Hasidic tradition whose impact on Celan is only now drawing the attention it deserves. The Baal Shem was he who knew the true names of being and things and who consequently recognized their secrets and was able to master the forces in them. Ultimately his goal was to bring the name closer to The Name, i.e. to unite beings and things with God, thereby becoming the "Master of the Good Name, Baal Shem Tov."[48]

Similarly, by evoking names, Celan struggled to come to terms with a God in whom he did not believe.[49] One recalls the lines from his "Psalm" that reads "No One molds us again out of the earth and clay/ . . . / Praise be to thee, No One." Though failing in this quest for God, he realized that only by returning to a pristine language could he find a meaningful substitute for naming the ultimate Good Name. In 1948, he wrote a little-known essay on the paintings of Edgar Jené. An almost programmatic statement there speaks of a journey into his "internal world" (*Innenwelt*) and of his attempts to create or return to a pristine language by naming things: "To be sure, before I began this journey I had seen that things were unpleasant and out of kilter in that world I had left, but I had believed I would be able to shake its very foundations if I named things by their proper name. I was aware that such an undertaking presupposed the return to a state of absolute

innocence. I envisioned this innocence in terms of a primeval view of the world purified of the dross of centuries of old lies."[50] Celan then explains how he summoned words "from the farthest regions of the spirit, veiled as in a dream and revealed as in a dream. And when they meet one another in their frenzied course, and the spark of the super- natural is born, when the strange is wedded to the strangest, I will gaze into the eye of the new holiness. It looks at me with a strange expres- sion, for although I conjured it up, it lives, after all, beyond the concep- tions of my conscious thoughts." These statements explain a later remark he often made about how highly he prized the "newness" of every single word in a poem, presumably meaning the primordial originality that his manner of creation lent to each word.

Two words in this statement about creating pristine poetic words—"spark" and "conjured"—recall the closing lines of one of his later poems that reflects on the possibilities of expression. Asking if articulation is possible, it reads: "Who/ is glistening, glistening, glistening?" ("What Is Written," G. "Das Geschriebene"). This question is simultaneously an incantation. The repetition of the question coincides with the act of creative "conjuring," while "glistening" corresponds to the spark of light associated here and in many poems with the creation of new language. Similar acts of incantation, which Celan describes in terms that reproduce almost verbatim a statement by Mallarmé about poetry as incantation, seem to occur in a number of his poems. The closing lines of "The Syllable Pain," for example, which plays on the German word for "letter" (*Buchstabe*), reads "beech-, beech-, beech-, staved, staved, staved." It recalls the original meaning of forming letters and words from beech staves (German *buchstabieren* = "to spell") while simultaneously attempting to evoke such letters. Another example can be found in the poem "No More Sand Art," where the closing lines read "Your Question—your answer./ Your song, what does it know?/ Deepinsnow/ Eepinnow,/ Ee--i--o." This reduction of a word to the sound level of its vowels has a double function. It is a cry of despair at the loss of the ability to utter anything meaningful; simultaneously it resembles a primitive incantation, in this case one which tries again to evoke a word.

This last example brings us back to the concretists, for this kind of reduction of a word to its single letters, with resulting unfamiliar graphic implications that go far beyond the word itself, is one of their trademarks. A poem by Franz Mon, for example, that begins with two corrupted proverbs, "Out of Sight, Out of the Frying Pan," and "Out of the Frying Pan, Out of Mind," leads to a similar reduction that

leaves only vowel sounds suggesting a range of sensations from pain
to the discomfort of getting wet, not to mention the visual effect of rain
falling:

a u s d e n a u g e n a u s d e m r e g e n

a u s d e m r e g e n a u s d e m s i n n

a a u u s s d d e e n m a r u e g g e e n n a a u u s s d d e e m m r s e i g n e n n

aauu   ee   ue   ee   aauu   ee   ei   e

    ssdd   nm   r   gg   nn   ssdd   mmrs   gn   nn

aa   n a   nnaa   n nn

   uu   ee   ue   ee   uu   ee   e   e

    ss   gg   ss   s g

      dd   dd   i

    ss ee   ee   ss ee se   e

      n r   nn   r   n nn

       m   mm

    dd   r   dd   r

  uu   u gg   uu   g

aa   a   aa   i

The visual games concrete poets play, both serious and
humorous, are well enough known to need few illustrations. But critics
often slight the subtle but telling visual elements that are so essential
to Celan's poetry. Two poems—"Speech Grill" and the opening
stanzas of "The Straitening"—illustrate this in the German original:

SPRACHGITTER

Augenrund zwischen den Stäben.

Flimmertier Lid
rudert nach oben,
gibt einen Blick frei.

Iris, Schwimmerin, traumlos und trüb:
der Himmel, herzgrau, muß nah sein.

Schräg, in der eisernen Tülle,
der blakende Span.
Am Lichtsinn
errätst du die Seele.

(Wär ich wie du. Wärst du wie ich.
Standen wir nicht
unter *einem* Passat?
Wir sind Fremde.)

Die Fliesen. Darauf,
dicht beieinander, die beiden
herzgrauen Lachen:
zwei
Mundvoll Schweigen.

★

VERBRACHT ins
Gelände
mit der untrüglichen Spur:

Gras, auseinandergeschrieben. Die Steine, weiβ,
mit den Schatten der Halme:
Lies nicht mehr—schau!
Schau nicht mehr—geh!

Geh, deine Stunde
hat keine Schwestern, du bist—
bist zuhause. Ein Rad, langsam,
rollt aus sich selber, die Speichen
klettern,
klettern auf schwärzlichem Feld, die Nacht
braucht keine Sterne, nirgends
fragt es nach dir.

The frequent dashes or words and sentences that break off mid-way
are the most obvious examples of the poet's anguished attempt to
speak. But what is the intention of the repeated broken lines? Or can
one interpret the tiny stars that precede each section of the long poem
"The Straitening" (German "Engführung") as Hans Mayer does to
mean that each star stands for a section of that stanza which was
omitted, and that the stanza actually begins in the middle?[51] Does it
have something to do with stars standing for unarticulated word
constellations? This is the only poem cycle where Celan uses such a
sign. Or can one agree with Siegbert Prawer, who sees the poem
"Speech Grill" as a visual representation on the printed page of
language built around its pauses, or as a "speech grill" or bars
between speech and silence?[52] Whatever the answers, Celan seems to
have shared with the concretists an interest in exploiting the visual
effects of his poems as graphic creations in a way few other recent
poets outside the concretists have done.

    One hardly needs to call attention to the humorous and fanciful
creations of concrete poetry. One thinks of Gomringer's graphic and
auditory representation of a ping-pong match:

ping pong
    ping pong ping
    pong ping pong
        ping pong

or of Reinhard Döhl's graphic showing dozens of occurrences of the
German word for "apple" joined to form a picture of an apple, but

with the single word for "worm" tucked away unobtrusively in the
text, or perhaps of Ernst Jandl's dedication "For Mack the Naif," to
mention a few:

```
 ,.ᴗ‎‍ʷ‍ ᴗ‍.ᴗ.. .
  ,‌pfelApfelApfelApteɪ‌ᴖ
 ᴗfelApfelApfelApfelApfelA
 ‍felApfelApfelApfelApfelApfe
 ApfelApfelApfelApfelApfelApfᴖ
 pfelApfelApfelApfelApfelApfelᴖ
 ‍ApfelApfelApfelApfelApfelApfe
 pfelApfelApfelApfelApfelApfelᴀ
 ApfelApfelApfelApfelApfelApfe
 ᴐfelApfelApfelApfelApfelApfel/
 \pfelApfelApfelApfelApfelApf
  ᴐlApfelApfelApfelWurmAᴘᶠ
   ᶠelApfelApfelApfelApfel/
    ᴖ ofelApfelApfelApfel/ᴗ
      ᴖfelApfelApfelAᶜ
       ᴀ ᴖfᴇlAnfel ᴀ
```

To view the concretists as the children of Dada and Surrealism
has become a commonplace of criticism that needs no elaboration.
Until recently, however, Celan's critics have minimized or over-
looked his debt to these predecessors, for his poetry reflects an earnest
struggle that for him became a matter of life and death. Yet some of his
early critics spoke of him as an heir to the French surrealist tradi-
tion,[53] and in fact he shares with the concretists a number of attitudes
and practices strongly reminiscent of Dada and Surrealism. Kurt
Oppens recognized this when he saw in the early poems "the trace of a
tragic clown."[54] Baumann reports that Celan personally liked certain
types of fun and clowning, and that his love of word play was matched
by his enjoyment of circuses.[55] One need not look far to locate these
playful elements. His "Rogue's and Rascal's Ditty sung in Paris
Emprès Pontoise by Paul Celan from Czernowitz near Sadagora,"
for example, sets an unusually playful mood for this otherwise
serious poet. Its word deformations "Mandelbaum, Bandelmaum./

Mandeltraum, Trandelmaum" (inspired by the name of the Soviet poet Mandelstam) sound much like concrete poetry or Dada. Critics have interpreted his stutterings, repetitions, and word mutilations as a desperate effort to overcome a crisis of language,[56] but the same might be said of Dadaists and Surrealists, who also sensed the bankruptcy of language as a medium. The result reminds us that "play" is still a basic part of aesthetic creation, a view to which Celan himself seems to have subscribed in parts of his 1960 Darmstadt speech on Georg Büchner.[57] Whether quoting in his poems the ambiguous nonsense word "Pallaksch" that the demented Hölderlin used to mean both "yes" and "no," whether in corruptions such as "Sipheten und Probyllen" (Eng. "sophets and pribyls"), or in brilliant neologisms like "Das Meingedicht, das Genicht" ("The pseudo-/ poem, The noem") where he fuses Middle High German *mein* in the sense of *Meineid* (perjury) with the word for poem (*Gedicht*), he probed for the essence of words by playing with them, deforming them, and creating anew from them.

   Bernhard Böschenstein reports that Celan often carried on conversations about German Baroque poetry, and that he especially liked the poetry of Quirinus Kuhlmann, another common ancestor of the concretists.[58] This admitted personal affinity for an unconventional "word jongleur" like Kuhlmann, who pushed language beyond its limits by transforming and playing with it, suggests further common ancestors ranging from the Greek bucolic poets and their *carmina figurata* through the cabalists, Mallarmé, and the Dadaists and Surrealists. The underlying attitude that seems to unite such disparate writers might be what Ernst Bloch referred to as "the solution to the aesthetic question of truth: art is a laboratory and simultaneously a festival in which all its possibilities, along with the known alternatives, are performed."[59] Here the accent would fall on the words "laboratory" and "possibilities."

   Bertolt Brecht, whose poetry appealed to neither Celan nor the concretists, nevertheless mastered and legitimated a practice imitated by them—the extensive citation or borrowing of another writer's material for one's own poetry. Brecht succeeded so well in his announced intention of re-establishing the practice of plagiarism in its "ancient inherent rights" and restoring it to social acceptibility[60] that by the fifties the concept of "original creativity" for both Celan and the concretists allowed them to include in their works extensive quotations and reworkings of word material by other writers that often were easily recognizable, in some cases even documented. Helmut

Mader, for example, in his "Poem for the Makers of Widow's Veils" ("gedicht für witwenschleiermacher"), acknowledges in a footnote that his poem cites passages from T.S. Eliot's "Hollow Men," from Marinetti's "Futurist Manifesto," and from Shakespeare's testament. This tendency of concretists to weave citations from world literature into their texts is particularly evident in Max Bense's works. At the end of his *components of passing (bestandteile des vorüber)*, he acknowledges James Joyce as the model for this kind of citation and gives credit for material in his texts quoted from Joyce, Lessing, Hegel, Proust, Benn, Brecht, Gertrude Stein, Arno Schmidt, Otto Wiener, and Helmut Heissenbüttel. Heissenbüttel himself, in *Textbuch 4,* presents a section entitled "Combinations" ("Zusammensetzungen") that consists entirely of citations in various languages from fifteen writers whose names he dutifully lists at the outset.

Celan, whose poetry coins some of the most powerful neologisms in the German language of this century, also employs a large number of direct or indirect citations. One finds quotations from the New Testament; from Dante's *Divine Comedy;* from Meister Eckhart; from Shakespeare's *King Lear* in the original English; from Hölderlin's biography; from Heine's poem "An Edom"; from Büchner's *Hessischer Landbote;* from a poem by Verlaine; and from a poem by Baudelaire via Hugo von Hofmannsthal, to mention the most obvious. And while one would expect him to avoid popular sources, he nevertheless quotes from extra-literary material and from snatches of language or texts he has overheard. The fragmentary Latin phrase *unde suspirat cor* in the poem "Anabasis" derives from the text of a Mozart composition he heard on a record.[61] The words appealed to him for their "dark vocalic sounds." Apparently the Yiddish song he cites in the poem "Benedicta" also was the result of hearing it sung on a record,[62] while "Call it Love" in "Huhediblu" is the title of a hit song as well as a poem by Hans Magnus Enzensberger. In "A Rogue and Rascal's Ditty" he cites passages from the soldier's song (*Landknechtslied*) "Wir kamen vor Friaul" as well as from a child's lullaby. A friend reports that the word "Blume" (flower) in one poem was a direct citation derived from the first word that the poet heard his son Eric utter in French,[63] a claim that sounds consistent with Celan's effort to establish a primeval language of innocence. The English citation "bits, on chips" must have been the result of a sign or menu he read, while the Spanish "no pasaran" was a slogan coined by Dolores Ibarruri for the Republican forces during

the defense of Madrid in the Spanish Civil War. And the poem "Du liegst" cites verbatim material taken from a documentary publication on the murder of Karl Liebknecht and Rosa Luxemburg.[64]

Celan often set his citations in italics or quotation marks to make them easily identifiable. He was equally candid in pointing them out to friends. Like the concretists, he made no attempt to conceal such material. When using language to reflect on the nature of language itself, it seemed logical that the words of others offered a legitimate form of making such statements by reacting to them. A notable example is a poem Celan wrote *contra* Brecht. By altering slightly two well-known lines from Brecht's "To Posterity" ("An die Nach-geborenen") that originally expressed the helplessness of the poet in dark times and the dilemma of writing verse when the world needed to be changed, Celan turned Brecht's words into a statement about language itself. Brecht's text reads: "What kind of times are these, where/ A conversation about trees is almost a crime/ Because it includes so much silence about misdeeds!" Celan's poem asks: "What kind of times are these/ Where a conversation/ is almost a crime/ because it includes/ so much talk?"/ ("A Leaf"). Here a corrupted citation functions among other things to question the ability of language to say anything meaningful about important matters.

A final area deserves brief attention for the parallels in theory and practice between Celan and the concretists. Both tend to go far beyond the limits of the German language for their word material. Celan's poems contain vocabulary from Middle High German, Yiddish, Danish, French, English, Spanish, Russian, and Hebrew. The concretists, who have been called the first truly international poetic movement,[65] also cut across national boundaries. Gomringer's early concrete poems were done in Spanish and German, while poets such as Rühm, Hans Carl Artmann, and Ernst Jandl work in and between several languages, as demonstrated by Jandl's famous "oberflächenübersetzung," ("superficial translation") which, in German phonetic transcription, turns out to be Wordsworth's "My Heart Leaps Up When I Behold":

> my heart leaps up when i behold
> a rainbow in the sky
> so was it when my life began
> so is it now i am a man
> so be it when i shall grow old
> or let me die!
> the child is father of the man

and i could wish my days to be
bound each to each by natural piety

(william wordsworth)

mai hart lieb zapfen eibe hold
er renn bohr in sees kai
so was sieht wenn mai läuft begehen
so es sieht nahe emma mähen
so biet wenn ärschel grollt
ohr leck mit ei!
seht steil dies fader rosse mähen
in teig kurt wisch mai desto bier
baum deutsche deutsch bajonett schur alp eiertier

Ernst Jandl's poem "Flamingo," whose title could belong to several
languages, purports to be in English, but it also generates words in
German (*Flammen*) without making sense in either language:

flamingo

```
flam          men
     in
        go home
              men only
        go home
     in
flam          men
```

```
(flam: sham, deceitful trick, lie;
      nonsense; kind of flourish
      on drum)
```

No other type of poetry has been anthologized so successfully and has found such an international audience, for, with the exception of language using ideograms, one needs to know little of the language in which this poetry is written to grasp what it is doing.

In spite of these and other unmentioned similarities in outlook, word choice, and use of language, one must read only a few of their poems to realize how radically Celan differs from the concretists. On a superficial level, most of his poems still transmit the optical image we have come to associate with conventional lyric poetry. They also exist within a recognizable syntactical system. More fundamentally, what for Celan is a quest with words is for the concretists an experiment with words. Randomness often plays a role in their word arrangements, but it is minimal in Celan's verse. While the concretists have largely abandoned conventional forms of structural principles in favor of the isolated word or the disconnected phrase, Celan's verse radiates a sense of form and a dedication to structural precision that leaves almost nothing to chance.

The reduction of language to its simplest forms under the concretists is often little more than that—a reduction, with little left that is memorable. But who, having once heard it, could not quote unforgettable lines from Celan's "Fugue of Death" or other of his poems. Celan strove to expand the limits of language. Attempts by the concretists to reinvest familiar words with meaning were often self-defeating. Apparently there is a limit to the degree that words derived from posters, newspaper headlines, bits of conversation, advertising slogans, scientific treatises, and labels on bottles can be defamiliarized sufficiently to be seen in a new light. But Celan's work with unfamiliar words, or with familiar words estranged through new combinations, did indeed push back the boundaries of contemporary poetic language.

For all their statements about the enervation of modern speech, the concretists still had what resembled a positive belief in their ability to revitalize words. This outlook contrasts sharply with Celan's ongoing despair at any form of expressibility and his skepticism toward language, which came to be a personal crisis. Yet paradoxically, it was Celan's near or imagined failure that succeeded in enriching German poetry with a body of verse which seems destined to remain. By contrast, the success of the concretists is less like the stellar constellation Gomringer evoked than like a comet that has blazed across the horizon and burned out. And though there will continue to be experimental poems as long as writers play games with

language, concrete poetry will probably take its place along with Dada as a literary movement that reflects something of its time without leaving much that endures.

The works of both Celan and the concrete poets have arisen in an age when it is perhaps easier to write a book *about* poetry than to write a book *of* poetry. It is true that since 1945 there have also been writers who seemed blissfully unconcerned about the limitations of language, and whose poetry based on common speech purports to derive its vitality from the very language which for Celan and the concretists made poetic expression impossible. But for writers at the extremity of language, this kind of poetry is no longer possible. Whether Celan and the concretists intensify for us the acute awareness of a so-called "speech crisis," or whether they merely reflect a state of mind symptomatic of our times cannot be answered easily. But what they produced adumbrated the self-consciousness of a new generation of younger German writers whose works increasingly have become reflections and meditations on and about language itself instead of about a world language once created and described.

In a letter to Klaus Demus written less than four months before his death, Celan responded to his friend's complaint about the difficulties of keeping his verse uncontaminated by the language our age forces upon us. Celan lamented: "This age is not poetic; it can no longer be so, and it wants us to incorporate in what we write this knowledge that it is unpoetic. More precisely: perhaps it still wants us to do this, among other things—perhaps."[66]

The concretists, whose work often comes precariously close to pop art, in large part acceded to this demand of an unpoetic age by their facile and often frivolous use of word material; Celan resisted it more than any single European poet of our time. Perhaps herein lies the ultimate difference in these poets, who felt they lived in what, to use a formulation by Bertolt Brecht, might be called "a bad age for poetry."

NOTES

(A WORD ON TRANSLATIONS: For English versions of Celan's poems, I have drawn in Michael Hamburger's selection Paul Celan: Poems. A Bilingual Edition *(New York: Persea Books, 1980). If Hamburger did not translate a particular poem cited in the text, the English rendering is mine. In such cases the text also includes a German title that can be located easily in the standard two-volume edition in German,* Paul Celan. Gedichte, ed. Beda Allemann *(Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, 1975). Unless otherwise stated, translations of other material from the German are my own).*

1. Beda Allemann, "Das Gedicht und seine Wirklichkeit," *Études Germaniques,* No. 3 (July-Sept., 1970), p. 267.

2. Eugen Gomringer, *worte sind schatten. die konstellationen 1951-1968* (Reinbek bei Hamburg: Rowohlt, 1969). Among other anthologies of international concrete poetry published in the late sixties and early seventies are *Concrete Poetry. An International Anthology,* ed. Stephan Bann (London: London Magazine Editions, 1967); *An Anthology of Concrete Poetry,* ed. Emmett Williams (New York, 1967), and *konkrete poëzie* (Amsterdam: Stedelijk Museum, 1971).

3. See the article "Visuelle Poesie. Bild vom Dichter," *Der Spiegel,* No. 32 (1970), p. 99, which speaks of signs of "premature inflation and old age" in "recent (also called 'concrete') poetry." In an essay published in 1969 entitled "Über konkrete Poesie," *Texte über Texte,* ed. Franz Mon (Neuwied: Luchterhand, 1970), p. 139, Mon, speaking of this poetry, states: "Perhaps its possibilities have been exhausted today." Hans Jürgen Heinrichs, "In der Folge der konkreten Poesie," *Akzente,* 6 (Dec., 1971), p. 534, says concrete poetry has become "superannuated," while Reinhard Döhl, himself a concrete poet, states in 1971 that the movement called "concrete poetry" appears to be "historically completed, surveyable, and more or less ready for a museum," *Die deutsche Literatur der Gegenwart. Aspekte und Tendenzen,* ed. Manfred Durzak (Stuttgart: Reclam, 1971), p. 280.

4. In a letter published in the volume *Über Paul Celan,* ed. Dietlind Meinecke (Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, 1970), pp. 26-27.

5. On Celan as a hermetic poet, see Hans Dieter Schäfer, "Zur Spätphase des hermetischen Gedichts," *Die deutsche Literatur der Gegenwart. Aspekte und Tendenzen,* pp. 148-169. On the concrete poets as experimenters, see Karl Krolow, "Die Rolle des Autors im experimentellen Gedicht," *Schattengefechte* (Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, 1965), pp. 39-64.

6. On Celan's troubled relationship to Johannes Bobrowski, see the essay by Peter Jokostra, "Celan ist bestenfalls eine Parfumfabrik," *Die Welt,* No. 253 (Oct. 30, 1971), p. v in the cultural section "Die geistige Welt." Hans Mayer reports that Celan felt a similar distance to Heinrich Böll, Walter Jens, Hans Magnus Enzensberger, and other contemporary writers. Statement made during discussion on Sept. 27, 1972 at a "Colloquium on Paul Celan" sponsored by the Goethe Institute of Paris from Sept. 25-29, 1972 in Paris.

7. "Ich-Gestalt und Dichtungsbegriff bei Paul Celan," *Études Germaniques,* No. 3 (July-Sept., 1970), p. 299.

8. Silvio Vietta, *Sprache und Sprachreflexion in der modernen Lyrik* (Bad Homburg vor der Höhe: Gehlen, 1970), p. 102. See also Dietlind Meinecke, *Wort und Name bei Paul Celan* (Bad Homburg vor der Höhe: Gehlen, 1970), p. 18, who states that "the poem conceives of itself as something spoken at the extremity of the speakable."

9. *Der Meridian. Rede anläßlich der Verleihung des Georg Büchner Preises* (Frankfurt/Main: S. Fischer, 1961), p. 17. English version entitled "The Meridian," trans. Jerry Glenn, *Chicago Review,* No. 3 (1978), pp. 29-40.

10. According to Emmett Williams in *An Anthology of Concrete Poetry,* p. vi.

11. "der dichter und das schweigen—expo 64," in *worte sind schatten,* p. 293.

12. "der dichter und das schweigen—expo 64," in *worte sind schatten,* p. 297.

13. Heinrich Stiehler, "Die Zeit der Todesfuge. Zu den Anfängen Paul Celans," *Akzente,* No. 1 (Feb., 1972), p. 11. See also Israel Chalfen, *Paul Celan. Eine Biographie seiner Jugend* (Frankfurt/Main: Insel, 1979).

14. According to his friend Klaus Demus. Reported at the "Colloquium on Paul Celan," Paris, Sept. 27, 1972.

15. See his essay "die ersten jahre der konkreten poesie," in *worte sind schatten,* p. 296, where he describes the influence of Mallarmé on his early development.

16. *Meridian,* p. 12.

17. See Kurt Oppens, "Blühen und Schreiben im Niemandsland," in *Über Paul Celan,* p. 110, and Meinecke, *Wort und Name bei Paul Celan,* p. 247.

18. In the afterword to *Rot Nr. 21. Konkrete Poesie international,* ed. Max Bense and Elisabeth Walter (Stuttgart: Walther, 1965), no page number.

19. "Zu Paul Celans neuem Gedichtband 'Atemwende'," in *Über Paul Celan,* p. 196.

20. Reported by Hans Mayer at the "Colloquium on Paul Celan," Paris, Sept. 27, 1972.

21. Max Bense, *bestandteile des vorüber* (Cologne: Kiepenheuer & Witsch, 1961), p. 117.

22. In his foreword to *worte sind schatten,* p. 12.

23. Reported by Dietlind Meinecke at the "Colloquium on Paul Celan," Paris, Sept. 25, 1972.

24. See Peter Horst Neumann, *Zur Lyrik Paul Celans* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1968), p. 17; Beda Allemann, "Paul Celan. Die Niemandsrose," *Neue Rundschau*, No. 1 (1964), p. 147; and Meinecke, *Wort und Name bei Paul Celan*, p. 70.

25. Bense, *bestandteile des vorüber*, p. 9.

26. *Texte über Texte*, p. 122.

27. Cited by Emmett Williams, *An Anthology of Concrete Poetry*, p. 337.

28. *Texte über Texte*, p. 23.

29. *worte sind schatten*, p. 298.

30. Ludwig Harig, foreword to *muster möglicher welten. eine anthologie für max bense*, ed. Elisabeth Walter and Ludwig Harig (Wiesbaden: Limes, 1971), p. 6.

31. "Ansprache anläßlich der Entgegennahme des Literaturpreises der Freien Hansestadt Bremen," *Paul Celan. Ausgewählte Gedichte*, ed. Beda Allemann (Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, 1968), p. 128. English translation by Walter Billeter in *Paul Celan. Prose Writings and Selected Poems* (Carlton, Victoria: Paper Castle, 1977).

32. Helmut Heissenbüttel, *Über Literatur* (Olten and Freiburg in Breisgau: Walter, 1966), p. 110.

33. *Der Meridian*, p. 23.

34. Max Bense, *bestandteile des vorüber*, p. 118.

35. *Texte über Texte*, p. 9.

36. Meinecke, *Wort und Name bei Paul Celan*, p. 66.

37. Schäfer, "Zur Spätphase des hermetischen Gedichts," p. 157.

38. "Ansprache anlässlich der Entgegennahme des Literaturpreises der Freien Hansestadt Bremen," p. 129.

39. *Texte über Texte*, p. 139.

40. Schäfer, "Zur Spätphase des hermetischen Gedichts," p. 158. For this title in English, I have used Joachim Neugroschel's rendering over Michael Hamburger's "language mesh," which to me fails to convey the original meaning of the word adequately.

41. Hans-Georg Gadamer, "Dichterschicksal-Menschenschicksal. Zum Beginn von 'Atemkristall'," p. 4 of unpublished paper presented at the "Colloquium on Paul Celan," Paris, Sept. 26, 1972.

42. Gerhart Baumann, ". . . Durchgründet vom Nichts," *Études Germaniques*, No. 3 (July-Sept., 1970), p. 286.

43. See James K. Lyon, "Paul Celan's Language of Stone: The Geology of the Poetic Landscape," *Colloquia Germanica*, No. 3/4 (1974), pp. 298-317.

44. Reported by Klaus Demus at the "Colloquium on Paul Celan," Paris, Sept. 25, 1972.

45.   Reported by Jörg Ortner, a Parisian friend of Celan's at the "Colloquium on Paul Celan," Paris, Sept. 26, 1972.

46.   ". . . Durchgründet vom Nichts," p. 286.

47.   ". . . Durchgründet vom Nichts," p. 286.

48.   Elie Wiesel, *Souls on Fire. Portraits and Legends of Hasidic Masters,* trans. Marion Wiesel (New York: Random House, 1972), p. 260.

49.   Siegbert Prawer, "Paul Celan," in *Über Paul Celan,* claims: "Dies ist die Sprache eines geborenen Gottsuchers, der Gott nicht gefunden hat, aber nicht ablassen kann, in der Hoffnung auf eine Antwort in die Bedeutungslosigkeit und Leere hineinzurufen . . ." p. 158.

50.   Paul Celan, *Edgar Jené und Der Traum vom Traume* (Vienna: Agathon, 1948), p. 8. English translation by Jerry Glenn, "Edgar Jené and the Dream of a Dream" *Boston University Journal,* (Winter, 1973), pp. 61-68.

51.   Reported by Hans Mayer at the "Colloquium on Paul Celan," Paris, Sept. 26, 1972.

52.   In *Über Paul Celan,* p. 150.

53.   See Horst Bienek, "Narben unserer Zeit," *Frankfurter Hefte,* No. 14 (1959), p. 607; Rudolf Nikolaus Maier, "Paul Celan: Sprachgitter," *Das moderne Gedicht* (Düsseldorf: Schwann, 1959), p. 144; and Hans Egon Holthusen, "Fünf junge Lyriker," *Ja und Nein* (Munich: Piper, 1954), p. 158.

54.   "Gesang und Magie im Zeitalter des Steins. Zur Dichtung Ingeborg Bachmanns und Paul Celans," *Merkur,* No. 17 (1963), p. 188.

55.   ". . . Durchgründet vom Nichts," p. 277.

56.   Meinecke, *Wort und Name bei Paul Celan,* pp. 186-87.

57.   *Der Meridian,* pp. 5, 11.

58.   In the "Colloquium on Paul Celan," Paris, Sept. 25, 1972.

59.   *Das Prinzip Hoffnung* (Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, 1959), p. 249.

60.   Bertolt Brecht, *Gesammelte Werke in 20 Bänden* (Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, 1967), XVIII, 79.

61.   Meinecke, *Worte und Name bei Paul Celan,* p. 277.

62.   Meinecke, *Wort und Name bei Paul Celan,* p. 276.

63.   Reported by Jean Bollack at the "Colloquium on Paul Celan," Paris, Sept. 26, 1972.

64.   See Peter Szondi, "Eden," *Celan-Studien* (Frankfurt/Main: Suhrkamp, 1972), pp. 118-120.

65.   In the afterword to *Rot Nr. 21. Konkrete Poesie international,* no page number.

66.   Unpublished letter dated January 21, 1970.